Debating the efficacy of smoking intervention strategies

Sir—in a recent "comment" in this journal, Davey Smith et al.1 extensively debate some potential intervention strategies mentioned briefly at the end of my paper "A birth cohort analysis of the smoking epidemic in West Germany."2 The primary, if not exclusive, intention of my paper was to provide descriptive data on the development of the "smoking epidemic" in this country. In fact, potential intervention strategies were not addressed at all in the first submission of the paper, and they were added only at the request of an anonymous reviewer.

One of the reasons for my reluctance to address potential intervention strategies, such as smoking policies at the workplace, was the fact that they indeed deserve an in depth discussion far beyond the scope of my paper. In particular, I fully agree with Davey Smith et al. that, "simple diffusion models, whether of research or public policy or of innovations in behaviour from the more educated to less educated sections of society" describe inadequately the complexity of health promotion and health behaviour change. This is trivial, however. What I missed in the comment by Davey Smith et al. are constructive proposals for scientifically sound approaches to the topic in addition to the series of potentially misleading ecological correlations which they provide. A useful first step would have been a careful review of more informative, individual level studies, which in fact support the efficacy of the potential intervention strategies briefly mentioned in my paper (provided that such strategies are applied in a suitable social context).

As a final note on the mode of publication of variance and dissent in scientific debate, I would have greatly appreciated being given a chance to reply before the publication of a "comment" that so strongly and selectively refers to a previous publication of mine.

HERMAN BRENNER
Department of Epidemiology, University of Ulm, D-89069 Ulm, Germany.


SHORT REVIEWS


An account of one of the most significant advances in epidemiology to date which shows that the nutrition of the fetus and newborn infant has significant effects on the health of the adult and that we must look to the improvement in health and nutrition of girls and young women and mothers during pregnancy if we are to prevent chronic diseases so widespread throughout the western world.


Internationally experts explore the causes, prevention, and reversibility of cancer, coronary heart disease, hypertension, and obesity and develop policy proposals out of their findings.


Makes available some of the classics of epidemiology by drawing on the choices of leading contemporary epidemiologists in selected publishing papers, both old and new.


Describes processes of strategic change in the National Health Service in relation to the organisational and managerial response to the HIV/AIDS epidemic.


An initial evaluation of the claims made for the radical reorganisation of the National Health Service resulting from the 1990 National Health Service and Community Care Act and its impact upon the equity of the delivery of health care, based on detailed empirical research by The King's Fund.


The text of this book has been structured to provide an ordered progression through stages of increasing difficulty, starting with simple epidemiological concepts and ending with the epidemiology of HIV/AIDS, in which most of the problems in epidemiology are encountered.


A critical review of the theory and methodology of subjective health measurement including the assessment of methods of evaluating change over time, potential uses for very short measures and appraisal of widespread generic measures.


Presents a large collection of references to seasonal variations and to weather and temperature effects in the same connection.


Details the process: defining aims and objectives; planning research, collecting, storing, and analysing information; involving the local community; presentation of information; and the development of action plans.


Provides critical evaluation of recent advances, placing the information in perspective by defining its present status, pointing out deficiencies and thereby indicating directions for further study and covering bacteriology, mycology, virology, parasitology and epidemiology.

PETER GRIME

Corrigendum


Several errors crept into the above article after proof reading. In Table 1, the fourth figure in the final column (341) should not be followed by four daggers. On the second line of the footnotes to Table 8, the first equation should read 0.05p<0.01. On the final row of Table 9, the third figure (3-65) should be followed by a dagger instead of a plus sign. The page numbers of the seventh item in the list of references should read 102-6.